



28:11-14 Summoning Shemuel (continued)

1. Midrash, Bereishit Rabbah 95:1

בא וראה כל מה שהכה הקב"ה בעולם הזה מרפא אותן לעתיד לבא, העורים מתרפאים שנאמר (ישעיהו לה) "אז תפקחנה עיני עורים", והפסחים מתרפאים שנאמר (שם) "אז ידלג כאיל פסח ותרון לשון אלם." וכשם שאדם הולך כך הוא בא, הולך עור ובא עור, חרש ובא חרש, אלם ובא אלם, כשם שהוא הולך לבוש כך הוא בא לבוש. ממי את למד? משמואל... ולמה כשם שהאדם הולך כך הוא בא? שלא יאמרו כשהם חיים לא ריפאן, משמתו ריפאן הקב"ה ואח"כ הביאן? דומה שאינן אותן, אלא אלו אחרים הם! אמר הקב"ה אם כן יעמדו כמו שהלכו ואח"כ אני מרפא אותן...

Come and see: Anyone Gd struck in this world, He will heal them in the future. The blind will be healed, as in Yeshayahu 35, "Then the eyes of the blind will be opened." The lame will be healed, as it says there, "Then the lame will leap like the hart, and the tongue of the mute will sing." Just as one goes, so one returns. One who goes blind will return blind, one who goes deaf will return deaf, one who goes mute will return mute, as one goes clothed so one will return clothed. How do we learn this? From Shemuel... And why does one return as he went? Lest people say, "Gd didn't heal them when they lived, did Gd really heal them and then bring them back? These must not be the same people; these are others!" So Gd said: If so, they will stand as they went, and then I will heal them...

2. Midrash, Vayikra Rabbah 26:7

"והוא עוטה מעיל" על שום (שמואל א ב) "ומעיל קטן תעשה לו אמו."

"And he was cloaked in a tunic" – As in (Shemuel I 2), "And his mother would make a small tunic for him."

3. Rabbi David Altschuler, Metzudat David to Shemuel I 28:14

והוא עוטה מעיל - והוא מלבוש המיוחד לאדם גדול וחשוב:

"And he was cloaked in a tunic" – A special garment for someone who is great and important.

4. Talmud, Berachot 18a-b

One who guards a dead body – even if it is not his responsibility – is exempt from Shema, the amidah and tefillin, and all biblical mitzvot...

One who transports bones may not put them in a sack or on a donkey and ride on them, for that would disgrace them...

Anyone who sees a dead body and does not escort it violates "One who mocks a pauper blasphemes against his Creator. (Proverbs 17:5)" And if he escorts him, what is his reward? Rav Asi said: Regarding him the text says, "One is a creditor of Gd, who aids the indigent," and "And one honours Him, who aids the needy."

Rabbi Chiya and Rabbi Yonatan were in discussion as they walked in a cemetery, and Rabbi Yonatan's *tzitzit* were out.

Rabbi Chiya said to him: Pick it up, lest they say, 'Tomorrow he will come to us, and now he mocks us?' Rabbi Yonatan replied: Do they know that much? Doesn't Ecclesiastes 9:5 say, "And the dead know nothing"! He responded: If you have read, you have not read twice; if you have read twice, you have not read thrice; if you have read thrice, they have not explained it to you. "For the living know they will die" are the righteous, who are called 'living' even in death...

"And the dead know nothing" are the wicked, who are called 'dead' even in life...

The sons of Rabbi Chiya travelled among the villages, and their learning became difficult for them. They laboured in pain to remember it. One of them said to the other: Does our [deceased] father know of this pain? The other replied: How would he know? Job 14:21 says, "His sons will be honoured and he will not know!" The other replied: Doesn't he know? Job 14:22 says, "His flesh will pain him, and his soul will mourn for itself!"...

"And the dead know nothing" are the wicked, who are called 'dead' even in life...

The sons of Rabbi Chiya travelled among the villages, and their learning became difficult for them. They laboured in pain to remember it. One of them said to the other: Does our [deceased] father know of this pain? The other replied: How would he know? Job 14:21 says, "His sons will be honoured and he will not know!" The other replied: Doesn't he know? Job 14:22 says, "His flesh will pain him, and his soul will mourn for itself!"...

The sons of Rabbi Chiya travelled among the villages, and their learning became difficult for them. They laboured in pain to remember it. One of them said to the other: Does our [deceased] father know of this pain? The other replied: How would he know? Job 14:21 says, "His sons will be honoured and he will not know!" The other replied: Doesn't he know? Job 14:22 says, "His flesh will pain him, and his soul will mourn for itself!"...

The sons of Rabbi Chiya travelled among the villages, and their learning became difficult for them. They laboured in pain to remember it. One of them said to the other: Does our [deceased] father know of this pain? The other replied: How would he know? Job 14:21 says, "His sons will be honoured and he will not know!" The other replied: Doesn't he know? Job 14:22 says, "His flesh will pain him, and his soul will mourn for itself!"...

The sons of Rabbi Chiya travelled among the villages, and their learning became difficult for them. They laboured in pain to remember it. One of them said to the other: Does our [deceased] father know of this pain? The other replied: How would he know? Job 14:21 says, "His sons will be honoured and he will not know!" The other replied: Doesn't he know? Job 14:22 says, "His flesh will pain him, and his soul will mourn for itself!"...

The sons of Rabbi Chiya travelled among the villages, and their learning became difficult for them. They laboured in pain to remember it. One of them said to the other: Does our [deceased] father know of this pain? The other replied: How would he know? Job 14:21 says, "His sons will be honoured and he will not know!" The other replied: Doesn't he know? Job 14:22 says, "His flesh will pain him, and his soul will mourn for itself!"...

5. Talmud, Shabbat 152a-b

Rav Chisda said: A person's soul mourns for himself for seven days, as it is written, 'His soul will be *avei* for himself,' and it is also written, 'And he performed, for his father, a seven day *eivel*.'

Rav Yehudah said: If there are no people to be comforted after a person's death, then ten men go sit in his place. There was such a case in Rav Yehudah's neighborhood, and each day Rav Yehudah brought a group of ten and they sat in his place. After seven days, the deceased appeared in a dream of Rav Yehudah and said to him, "May your mind rest, for you caused rest for my mind."

Rabbi Avahu said: The deceased knows all that is said in its presence, until the grave is closed...

28:15-19 Shemuel's message

6. Radak to Shemuel I 28:15

הרגזתני - ממנוחתי:

"You agitated me" from my rest.

7. Talmud, Shabbat 152b

נשמתן של צדיקים גנוזות תחת כסא הכבוד, שנאמר "והיתה נפש אדני צרורה בצרור החיים", ושל רשעים...

The souls of the righteous are stored under the Divine Throne, as it is written, "The soul of my master should be bound in the bond of life," and the souls of the wicked...

8. Midrash, Vayikra Rabbah 26:7

א"ל לא היה לך להרגיזי בוראך אלא עשיתני עבודת כוכבים? אין אתה יודע כשם שנפרעין מן העובדין כך נפרעין מן הנעבדין?

He said to him: You had no means of agitating your Creator, other than to make me an idol? Don't you know that just as they punish the worshipper, so they punish the worshipped?

9. Don Isaac Abarbanel to Shemuel I 28:15

... והיה הרגזו בהתיחדו עתה הגוף המקודש אשר לו שהיה בחייו מעון לשכינה עם כח השד.

... And his agitation was because [Shaul] had associated this sanctified body, which during his lifetime had been a home for the Shechinah, with the power of a sheid.

10. צר לי מאד Shemuel II 24:14

11. Talmud, Berachot 12b

ואילו אורים ותומים לא קאמר, משום דקטליה לנוב עיר הכהנים.

And he did not mention the urim v'tummim, because he had killed out Nov, city of the kohanim.

12. "Tell me what to do!" Shemuel I 10:8

13. Shaul Tchernichovsky, בעין דור <https://benyehuda.org/read/6101>

<p>Why did You take me from after the sheep And You made me leader over Your nation as today (9:27); I finished all of my strength in the storms of war, And my happiness in my home is already ruined. You surrounded me with Philistines, fears of death – The ruach raah depressed me to the point of death. Man of Gd! What would Gd answer me? For He has left me. What should I do? Answer me! Why, O, did You anoint me as king upon Your nation? Why did You take me from after the sheep?</p>	<p>מדוע מאסר הצאן לקחתני ולנגיד על עמך כיום זה שמתני; כליתי כל פחי בסערות מלחמה, ואשרי בבית כבר הנה לשממה. עם פלשת סבוני, בעויתי-צלמנת – הרוח הרעה תדכאני עד מנת. איש-האלקים! מה קל יענני? כי סר מעלי – מה אעשה? ענני! מדוע, הוה, מלך על עמך משחתני, מדוע מאסרי הצאן לקחתני?</p>
---	---

14. "And Gd did to him"

- Radak "And Gd did to you"
- Targum "And David became your foe, and Gd did to him"
- Prof. Kil "And Gd did as Gd chose"

15. Midrash, Vayikra Rabbah 26:7

א"ל: ולית הלון מלה קדמייתא דהוות אמר לי! כד הוית גבי הוית אמר 'ונתנה לרעך הטוב ממך'... א"ל: כד הוינא גבך הוינא בעולם דשקר והוית שמיע מיני מלין שקרין דהוינא דחיל מינד דלא תקטילונגי, וכדון דאנא בעולם דקושטא לית את שמיע מיני אלא מלין דקשוט.

[Shaul] said to him, "This is not what you told me before! When you were with me, you said, 'And He has given it to your friend, who is better than you'"... [Shemuel] said to him, "When I was with you, I was in the world of falsehood,

and you heard false things from me, because I feared you, lest you kill me. Now I am in the world of truth. You will only hear truth from me."

16. Abarbanel to Shemuel II 21:1

והנה מתו גם כן רבים מישראל עם שאול במלחמה, לפי שהמה גם כן היו בני מות אחרי אשר לא מיחו בידי שאול מהרוג את הכהנים כמו שמיחו בידו מהרוג את יהונתן...

ואמנם למה נענשו הבנים בעון אביהם המרצח? כבר התעוררו חז"ל לזה (יבמות פ"ח ע"ט ע"א), "וא"ר יוחנן מוטב שתעקר אות אחת בתורה ואל יתחלל שם שמים בפרהסיא."

וכפי הפשט והסברה הישרה נשיב לזה שמה שאמרה תורה (דברים כ"ד ט"ז) "לא יומתו אבות על בנים ובנים לא יומתו על אבות," היא אזהרה לבית דין במשפט האנושי שלא יעשו כן ולא יובן זה על המשפט האלקי, כי הוא פוקד עון אבות על בנים ועל בני בנים על שלשים ועל רבעים, ואם כן דינא זוטרא ודינא רבא איכא בינייהו.

ואם תשאל למה לא היו בענין הזה שוים הדין האלקי עם המשפט האנושי אשר צוה לעשותו? אני אשיבך מלין שהאלוק ית' גזר שיענשו בדינו הבנים על האבות להיותם חלק מהאב עצם מעצמיו ובשר מבשרו, וכיון שהיה העונש למוד ומוסר לבני האדם ששישמעו וייראו ולא יזידון לעשות עוד, היה מהראוי שגם אחרי מות החוטא (איוב ה:ד) "ירחקו בניו מישע," יענשו בחטאו וידכאו בשער ואין מציל, כי הוא עונש גדול יגיע אצל אבות המתים ונפשיהם עליהם תאבל, כי בלי ספק עונג הבנים הצלחתם וצערם מגיע לאבות גם אחרי מותם, וכמו שבאו על זה פסוקים רבים בתורה מורים עליו.

והראוי שנאמין שהבן הצדיק לא יענש בעון האב חלילה לקל מרשע, ואין הקב"ה מקפח שכר כל בריה ובריה, אבל להיותו ית' בוחן לבות חוקר כליות בראותו בני הרשעים שהם גם כן דור סורר ומורה דור לא טהור בעיניו, וכשאוחזין מעשה אבותיהם בידיהם יענישם בחטא אבותיהם, כי בזה נתחברו שני הענינים, ר"ל הענישים על חטאת אבותיהם ולכלות הקוצים מן הכרם ויתמו רשעים מן הארץ. ולהיות הבחינה הזאת מסורה לקל ית' כי הוא יודע תעלומות לב, לכן היה זה מיוחד בדינא רבה לפני כסא כבודו שהוא יעניש הבנים על עון אבותם כשהיו לפניו גם הם רעים וחטאים, או יהיו בטבעם מוכנים וראויים לחטא...

Many Jews also died with Shaul in the war, because they also deserved to die, for not protesting against Shaul's murder of the kohanim as they protested against killing Yehonatan...

But why were the sons killed for the sin of their murderous father? Our Sages have already addressed this, "And Rabbi Yochanan said: Better for a single letter of the Torah to be uprooted, rather than have the Name of Heaven desecrated in public."

According to the simple explanation and straight logic, we could answer this by saying that when the Torah said, "Fathers shall not be executed for sons, and sons shall not be executed for fathers," that was a warning to a rabbinical court, in human jurisprudence, not to do this. It cannot be understood to apply to Divine jurisprudence, for He accounts the sin of fathers upon children and upon grandchildren, to the third and fourth generation. If so, the difference is between "little justice" and "great justice".

And if you will ask: Why are Divine law and the human jurisprudence He commanded not the same? I will respond that Gd decreed that in His law sons be punished for fathers because they are part of the father, bone of his bones and flesh of his flesh. And since punishment provides ethical instruction for people, for they will hear and fear and not dare to do it again, it makes sense that even after the sinner dies, "children will be distant from salvation," they shall be punished for his sin and crushed in the gate with none to save them, for this is a great punishment that will reach the deceased fathers, and their souls will grieve for them, for without a doubt the pleasure and success of children, and their pain, reaches the fathers after their deaths, as is taught in many biblical verses.

It is appropriate to believe that a righteous son would not be punished for his father's guilt; it would be a desecration for Gd to perform injustice, and Gd does not cheat anyone of their reward. But because Gd examine hearts and investigates innards, when He sees that the sons of the wicked are also a rebellious generation, a generation that is not pure in His eyes, and they hold to the deeds of their ancestors, He punishes them for the sins of their ancestors. The two matters join, meaning, punishing them for their fathers' sins and eliminating thorns from the vineyard and the wicked will disappear from the earth. And because this examination is only conducted by Gd, for He knows the hidden heart, therefore, it is only for the great justice before His throne to punish sons for the sin of their fathers when they are also wicked and sinful before Him, or by nature they are set to sin...