

"She is Zion; No One Seeks Her"

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

1. Rabbi Tzidkiyahu haRofei (13<sup>th</sup> century Germany), Shibbolei haLeket 269

ואין נופלין על פניהם שהרי נקרא מועד, שנאמר "קרא עלי מועד לשבור וגו' (איכה א)"

We do not fall forward, for it is called *moed*, as in Eichah 1, "He declared a *moed* upon me, to break etc."

2. Zecharyah 8:19

כֹּה־אָמַר ד' צְבָקוֹת צוֹם הָרְבִיעִי וְצוֹם הַחֲמִישִׁי וְצוֹם הַשְּׁבִיעִי וְיְהִי לְבֵית־יְהוּדָה לְשִׂשׂוֹן וּלְשִׂמְחָה וּלְמַעֲדִים טוֹבִים...

So declares Gd, Master of multitudes: The fast of the fourth and the fast of the fifth and the fast of the seventh and the fast of the tenth will be, for the house of Judea, for joy and happiness and great occasions...

Understanding Yirmiyahu 30:17

3. Yirmiyahu 30:17

כִּי אָעֵלָה אֶרְכָּה לָךְ וּמִמְכֹּתֶיךָ אֶרְפָּאךָ נָאִם ד' כִּי נִדְחָה קְרָאוּ לָךְ צִיּוֹן הִיא דָרַשׁ אֵין לָהּ:

For I will bring you healing, and I will heal you of your wounds; this is the word of Gd. For they called you 'rejected' [saying] "She is Zion, no one seeks her."

4. Malbim to Yirmiyahu 30:17

עתה באר הטעם מדוע יענשו אלה שהרעו לך והלא היו שלוחי ד' להעניש אותך, כי הם קראו לך בשם "נדחה" ... ר"ל שהם לא זכרו שאתה דומה כבן שחטא לאביו ומסרו לאיש ליסר אותו כדי שישוב מדרכו הרעה, שצריך האיש לזהר בל יאבד אותו לגמרי, רק ייסרהו כפי הצורך להשיבו למוטב ובחמלה רבה. אבל הם אמרו שציון היא נדחה שד' הדיח אותה מפניו ולא ישיב אותה עוד, ולכן דורש אין לה לריב ריבה ואין מי שיבקש דמה מידיהם, ולכן עשו בה כלה ונחרצה:

Now it explains why those who harmed you will be punished. Are they not Divine agents sent to punish you? But they called you "rejected"... Meaning, they did not remember that you are like a son who has sinned against his father, who then assigned him to someone to punish him, so that he would return from his bad ways. This man must be careful lest he destroy [the son] entirely, but only punish him as needed to return him to the good, and with great compassion. But they said that Zion is rejected, that Gd has pushed her from His presence and will not take her back again, and therefore no one seeks her, to fight on her behalf, and no one will seek her blood from his hands. Therefore, they destroyed her thoroughly.

5. Talmud, Rosh HaShanah 30a

מנא לן דעבדינן זכר למקדש? א"ר יוחנן דאמר קרא "כי אעלה ארוכה לך וממכותיך ארפאך נאם ד', כי נדחה קראו לך, ציון היא, דורש אין לה." "דורש אין לה", מכלל דבעיא דרישה.

How do we know to memorialize the Temple? Rabbi Yochanan cited Jeremiah 30:17, "For I will bring you healing, and I will heal you of your wounds," this is the word of Gd. For they called you 'rejected' [saying] 'She is Zion, no one seeks her.'" "No one seeks her" – this teaches that she requires seeking.

6. Rabbi Yosef Dov Soloveitchik (20<sup>th</sup> century USA), Reshimot Shiurim to Succah 41a

ונראה שבזכר למקדש יש שני דינים:

(א) הלכות אבילות זכר למקדש, זוהי הגמ' בב"ב, היסוד של דינים אלו נלמד מהפסוק "אם אשכחך ירושלים" והוא לזכור ירושלים כפי שהיתה ולהתאבל על חורבנה.

(ב) דין לזכור את המצוות הקשורות למקדש - היינו להעלות על לבנו את המקדש כשהיה בבניינו, ב"ב, וזוהי הסוגיא שלפנינו. יסוד דינים אלו מהפסוק "ציון היא דורש אין לה", אין בכך חלות אבילות על העבר, אלא קיום על שם העתיד לבא כשהמקדש יבנה.

ויתכן שזכר כפול זה מרומז בקרא במגילת איכה "זכרה ירושלים ימי עניה ומרודיה כל מחמדיה אשר היו לה מימי קדם". "ימי עניה ומרודיה" - היינו החורבן והאבילות עליו. "כל מחמדיה" - היינו המצוות שנתקיימו במקדש מאז ואנו מקיימים אותן עתה ע"ש המקדש כשהיה בבניינו.

It appears that there are two elements in "memorializing the Mikdash":

(1) The laws of mourning to remember the Mikdash. This is Bava Batra (60b). The foundation of this is learned from the verse, "If I forget you, Jerusalem." This is to remember Jerusalem as she was, and mourning her ruin.

(2) The law to remember the mitzvot connected with the Mikdash – meaning, to set in our hearts the Mikdash as it will be when it is built – speedily in our days – and this is our [talmudic] passage. The foundation of these laws is from the verse, "She is Zion, no one seeks her." This is not mourning for the past, but fulfilling for the future when the Mikdash will be built.

Perhaps this dual memorial is hinted in the verse in Eichah (1:7), "Jerusalem remembers the days of her affliction and suffering, all of her treasures, which she had in earlier days." "The days of her affliction and suffering" – the ruin and the mourning for it. "All of her treasures" – the mitzvot fulfilled in the Mikdash then, which we fulfill now for the Mikdash which will be built.

#### 7. Mishnah Sotah 9:14

בפולמוס של אספסינוס גזרו על עטרות חתנים ועל האירוס. בפולמוס של טיטוס גזרו על עטרות כלות...

In Vespasian's invasion, they decreed against the crowns of grooms and against the drum. In the invasion of Titus, they decreed against the crowns of brides...

#### 8. Mishnah Taanit 4:6-7

משנכנס אב ממעטין בשמחה. שבת שחל תשעה באב להיות בתוכה אסור מלספר ומלכבס...

When the month of Av enters we reduce our joy. In the week of Tishah b'Av one may neither cut hair nor do laundry ...

#### 9. Talmud, Pesachim 115a

מברך על אכילת מצה ואכיל, והדר מברך על אכילת מרור ואכיל, והדר אכיל מצה וחסא בהדי הדדי בלא ברכה, זכר למקדש כהלל.  
[O]ne recites the blessing on *matzah* and eats it, and then one recites the blessing on *maror* and eats it, and then one eats *matzah* and lettuce together without a blessing, a memorial to the Beit HaMikdash like Hillel.

#### 10. Mishnah Succah 3:12

בראשונה היה לולב ניטל במקדש שבעה ובמדינה יום אחד. משחרב בית המקדש התקין רבן יוחנן בן זכאי שיהא לולב ניטל במדינה שבעה זכר למקדש.

At first the *lulav* was taken in the Temple for seven days, and outside for one day. When the Temple was destroyed, Rabban Yochanan ben Zakkai enacted that the *lulav* should be taken outside for seven days, to remember the Temple.

#### 11. Rabbi Levi Yitzchok Horowitz, *When and how to mourn: Judaism's many contradictions*

The same Jew who spends his midnight hours reciting *Tikkun Chatzos* in tearful memory of the Destruction, nevertheless marches proudly and happily around the *bimah* in *shul* with his *esrog* and *lulav* on Sukkos – in commemoration of Temple times. So he not only cries, in remembrance of the Temple; he dances, too. The same family that sits on the floor on *erev Tish'a B'Av* eating eggs and ashes, several months later sets a luxuriant table for its Pesach meal – and, leaning in a kingly manner, eats *matzah* and *marror* (bitter herbs) wrapped together to remember how Hillel ate it in the time of the Temple. *Matzah* and *Marror* are not the only things wrapped together at the *seder*, our joy and our remembrance are intertwined too, not only in *korech* (Matzah Sandwich), but in the roasted egg and shankbone on the *seder*-plate and in the *afikoman* as well, all commemorations of what we had in the *Beis Hamikdash* that is no longer standing.

#### 12. Talmud, Bava Batra 60b

כשחרב הבית בשניה רבו פרושין בישראל שלא לאכול בשר ושלא לשתות יין. נטפל להן ר' יהושע. אמר להן: בני! מפני מה אי אתם אוכלין בשר ואין אתם שותין יין? אמרו לו: נאכל בשר שממנו מקריבין על גבי מזבח ועכשיו בטל? נשתה יין שמנסכין על גבי המזבח ועכשיו בטל? אמר להם: א"כ, לחם לא נאכל שכבר בטלו מנחות! אפשר בפירות. פירות לא נאכל שכבר בטלו בכורים! אפשר בפירות אחרים. מים לא נשתה שכבר בטל ניסוך המים! שתקו.

אמר להן: בני, בואו ואומר לכם: שלא להתאבל כל עיקר אי אפשר, שכבר נגזרה גזרה. ולהתאבל יותר מדאי אי אפשר, שאין גזרין גזירה על הצבור אא"כ רוב צבור יכולין לעמוד בה...

When the second Temple was destroyed, there were many Jews who separated, not wishing to eat meat or drink wine. Rabbi Yehoshua dealt with them. He said to them, "My children, why do you neither eat meat nor drink wine?" They replied, "Shall we eat meat, which they bring on the altar and which is now halted? Shall we drink wine, which they pour on the altar and which is now halted?" He replied, "Then we should not eat bread, for the flour offerings are halted!" "We can eat produce." "We should not eat produce, for the gift of the first produce is halted!" "We can eat other produce." "We should not drink water, for the libation of water is halted!" They fell silent.

He said, "My children, let me tell you something. Not to mourn at all is impossible; the decree has been made. Mourning too much is impossible, for one cannot issue a decree upon the community unless most of the community can bear it..."

13. Rabbi Levi Yitzchok Horowitz, *When and how to mourn: Judaism's many contradictions*

"When Av enters." the *Shulchan Aruch* (Code of Jewish Law) codifies, we lessen our happiness." Tellingly, though, we are exhorted to "lessen." Not to discontinue.

#### The Message

14. Yirmiyahu 36:23

וַיְהִי כִּקְרֹא יְהוּדִי שְׁלֹשׁ דְּלִתּוֹת וְאַרְבָּעָה יִקְרָעָהּ בְּתַעַר הַסֹּפֵר וַהֲשִׁלָּהּ אֶל הָאֵשׁ אֲשֶׁר אֵל הָאֵחַ עַד תָּם כָּל הַמְּגִלָּה עַל הָאֵשׁ אֲשֶׁר עַל הָאֵחַ:  
And it was, when Yehudi read three or four columns, [the king] took the scribe's razor and tore it out and threw it into the fire in the fireplace, until the entire scroll was finished in the fire in the fireplace.

15. Yirmiyahu 38:6

וַיִּקְחוּ אֶת יִרְמְיָהוּ וַיִּשְׁלְכוּ אֹתוֹ אֶל הַבּוֹר מִלְּכִיָּהוּ בֶן הַמֶּלֶךְ אֲשֶׁר בְּחֶצֶר הַמְּטָרָה וַיִּשְׁלְחוּ אֶת יִרְמְיָהוּ בְּחַבְלִים וּבַבּוֹר אֵין מַיִם כִּי אִם טִיט וַיִּטְבַּע יִרְמְיָהוּ בְּטִיט:  
And they took Yirmiyahu and they threw him into the pit of Malkiyahu the prince in the yard of imprisonment, and they lowered Yirmiyahu in ropes, and there was no water in the pit, but only clay, and Yirmiyahu sunk into the clay.

And they took Yirmiyahu and they threw him into the pit of Malkiyahu the prince in the yard of imprisonment, and they lowered Yirmiyahu in ropes, and there was no water in the pit, but only clay, and Yirmiyahu sunk into the clay.

16. Yirmiyahu 43:5-7

וַיִּקַּח יוֹחָנָן בֶּן קָרַיִשׁ וְכָל שְׂרֵי הַחַיִּלִּים אֶת כָּל שְׂאֲרֵי יְהוּדָה... וַיָּבֵאוּ אֶרְצָן מִצְרַיִם, כִּי לֹא שָׁמְעוּ בְּקוֹל ד' וַיָּבֵאוּ עַד תַּחְפָּנְחָס:  
And Yochanan ben Kareiach and all of the officers took the entire remnant of Judea... And they came to the Land of Egypt, for they did not listen to the voice of Gd. And they came to Tachpanches.

17. Rabbi Aharon Lichtenstein, *Diaspora Religious Zionism: Some Current Reflections*

In *Religious Zionism Post Disengagement: Future Directions*, pg. 24

The source [Yirmiyahu 30:17] is cited here with respect to a very specific halakhic ordinance, and it presumably serves as the *raison d'être* for similar ordinances. Unquestionably, however, it serves equally to enunciate a principle whose scope extends beyond the explicitly normative to embrace the realm of consciousness and sensibility. To sustain the memory of mikdash, that whose locus is in Jerusalem and that which coincides with the boundaries of the concentric country, is to vivify it, to rejuvenate it via mental image and soul's yearning.

*Derishat Zion* (seeking out Zion), *zekher lemikdash* – this has, traditionally and historically, been the central charge of Diaspora religious Zionism. Of course, it was not denominated as such; but sans nomenclature, with nary a notion about political structure and activity, with no meaningful prospect of implementing its agenda, for millennia, dispersed Jewry persisted in keeping the dream and its underlying and overarching faith alive. Those abiding elements remain a vital aspect of our collective and personal spiritual existence. We have neither the right nor the inclination to waver in our commitment to them, and this sustenance and transmission continue to constitute a sacred charge.