

**The Abraham & Millie Arbesfeld
Kollel & Midreshet Yom Rishon**
Sunday Morning Learning Programs for Men & Women

W W W.KOLLELYOMRISHON.ORG
W W W.MIDRESHETYOMRISHON.ORG

*Do We Talk Enough
About Heresy?*

Sponsored by Bella Hochberg in memory of her husband, Mordechai Yitzchak ben Shmuel v` Fayge Peshe, whose Yahrzeit is on the 15th of Sivan.



Rabbi Ari Lamm
May 13, 2018 • כ"ח אייר תשע"ח

Do We Talk Enough About Heresy?

על המינים ואופיים בתלמודם שלתנאים

צבי אריה לאם



1) Early Uses of the Term “Heresy”

A) Josephus, <i>Life</i> 10, 12 (c. 95 CE)	B) Acts 15.5 (late 1 st c. CE)	C) Acts 24.14-15
And when I was about sixteen years old, I had a mind to comprehend the several αἱρέσεων that were among us. These [<i>hairseseis</i>] are three: The first is that of the Pharisees, the second that Sadducees, and the third that of the Essenes, as we have frequently told you; for I thought that by this means I might choose the best, if I were once acquainted with them all... So when I had accomplished my desires, I returned back to the city, being now nineteen years old, and began to conduct myself according to the rules of the [<i>haireisis</i>] of the Pharisees, which is like that of the Stoics, as the Greeks call them.	5 Then some of the believers who belonged to the αἱρέσεως of the Pharisees stood up and said, “The Gentiles must be circumcised and required to keep the law of Moses.”	14 However, I admit that I worship the God of our ancestors as a follower of the Way, which they call a αἵρεσις. I believe everything that is in accordance with the Law and that is written in the Prophets, 15 and I have the same hope in God as these men themselves have, that there will be a resurrection of both the righteous and the wicked.

2) Later Uses of “Heresy”

Irenaeus (c. 130 – 200 CE; Gaul) , <i>Against Heresies</i> , Pref. 2
I do this, in order that thou, obtaining an acquaintance with these things, mayest in turn explain them to all those with whom thou art connected, and exhort them to avoid such an abyss of madness and of blasphemy against Christ. I intend, then, to the best of my ability, with brevity and clearness to set forth the opinions of those who are now promulgating heresy. I refer especially to the disciples of Ptolemaeus, whose school may be described as a bud from that of Valentinus. I shall also endeavour, according to my moderate ability, to furnish the means of overthrowing them, by showing how absurd and inconsistent with the truth are their statements.

3) Minut

Mishnah, <i>Sanhedrin</i> 4.5 (early 3 rd century CE)	
לפיכך ברא אדם יחיד י בעולם...ושל א יאמרו המינים, רשייות הרבה בשמים	Therefore man was created alone in the world...so that the <i>minim</i> shall not say that there are many powers in heaven.
Mishnah, <i>Megillah</i> 4.8 [according to MS Kaufmann A 50]	
העושה תפילתו עגולה סכנה, [מפני] שאין בה מצוה. נתנה על מצחו, או על פס ידו הרי זו דרך המינות; ציפה זב, ונתנה על בית יד שלינוקלו <נקלו?> הרי זו דרך החיצונים	If one makes his phylactery round, it is a danger since he has not fulfilled the commandment with it. If he puts it on his forehead or the palm of his hand, this is the way of <i>minut</i> . If he overlaid it with gold or placed it on the sleeve of his cloak, this is the way of the outsiders.
Tosefta, <i>Berakhot</i> 3.25 (mid-late 3 rd century CE)	
שמונה עשרה ברכות שאמרו חכמים כנגד	The Eighteen Benedictions that the sages prescribed correspond to the

<p>שמנה עשרה אזכרות שבהו לה' בני אלים כולל של מינים בשל פרושין ושל גרים בשל זקנים ושל דוד בבונה ירושלם אם אמר אלו לעצמן ואילו לעצמן יצא</p>	<p>eighteen mentions [of the Divine Name] in [Psalm 29]. One includes the benediction concerning <i>minim</i> in the one about separatists, and the benediction concerning proselytes in the one about the elders, and the benediction concerning David in the one about the Builder of Jerusalem. If he said them individually he has fulfilled his obligation.</p>
---	--

4) Definitional Positivity

<p>Responsa <i>Hatam Sofer</i>, 1.160</p>	
<p>תנן משנכנס אב ממעטין בשמחה ואמר רב בגמרא [כ"ט סע"א] כשם שמשנכנס אב וכו' כך משנכנס אדר מרבין בשמחה וא"ר פפא הלכך האי בר ישראל דאית ל' דינא פהדי נכרי לשתמיט מיני' באב ולימצי לי' באדר. והרמב"ם פ"ה מתענית [ה"ו] כתב משנכנס אב ממעטין ולא כתב הא דלשתמיט מנכרי אמנם בש"ע בהלכות ט"ב [סי' תקנ"א סעיף א'] הוסיף וכתב הא דלשתמיט, ואמנם בהלכות מגילה לא כתב הרמב"ם ולא הש"ע הא דמרבין בשמחה ולא הא דלימצי לנכרי</p>	<p>We learn [in a <i>mishnah</i>]: When Av arrives we reduce joy. Rav said in the Talmud: Just as when Av arrives [we reduce joy], so when Adar arrives we increase joy. And R. Pappa adds: Therefore a Jew should refrain from litigating against a gentile during Av [since the Jew's <i>mazal</i> is degraded in relation to the gentile's at this time] and instead litigate against him in Adar [since the Jew's <i>mazal</i> will be enhanced in relation to the gentile's at this time]. Now, the Rambam records that when Av arrives we reduce [joy] – although he does not record the practice to avoid litigation against a gentile [in Av]. And the Shulchan Aruch records [the law that in Av we reduce joy] as well as [the practice] to refrain [from litigating in Av]. But in the laws of Megillah neither the Rambam <i>nor</i> the Shulchan Aruch record the law that we increase joy [in Adar], nor the practice that we should litigate against gentiles [in Adar]!</p>