

Chullin 40

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

40a

Mishnah: More regarding shechitah for idolatry

- Shechitah for idolatry is disqualified
- Shechitah by two people, with one intending idolatry, is disqualified

Gemara: Does shechitah for mountains, rivers, etc prohibit benefit from the korban?

Our mishnah's language was פסולה, which may only mean the shechitah is disqualified¹

- But I have a Tosefta saying that שחיטה for mountains, rivers, etc makes זבחי מתים!
- It depends on whether your intent was for the physical entity,² or its deity^{3 4}

Gemara: Shechting another's animal for idolatry

- Rav Huna - Bowing to another's animal⁵ is ineffective.⁶ Shechting 1 סימן prohibits, like Ulla re: a 'real deed'
- Why does a braisa say I am liable for שחוטתי חוץ for idolatry? It's idolatry right away!
- (40b) Answers
 - Rav Pappa – It's a bird, so the first סימן is both outside and idolatry
 - But the "real deed" is complete for idolatry even before the first סימן, before שחוטתי חוץ!
 - It's where he said he would perform idolatry with the conclusion
 - Then why was it a חטאת specifically? Let it be any זבה!⁷
 - Mar Zutra/Rav Pappa – It's where the bird already was חצי קנה פגום, and your act completed it
 - Rav Pappa – Had Rav Huna not said "סימן 1", I'd have answered that Ulla required a big deed
 - Rav Pappa – Had Rav Huna not said "another's", I'd have answered that Ulla was only re: yours
 - Even though it's a חטאת, since you use it for כפרה it is considered "yours"

Gemara: Issue of אין אדם אוסר דבר שאינו שלו (prohibiting another's property)

- Rav Nachman/Rav Amram/Rav Yitzchak – We can't prohibit others' items
- Challenge #1 – You just said I could be liable for idolatry in שחיטה of a chatas!
 - It's like yours, because you atone with it
- Continued on 41a...

¹ As a d'rabbanan (Rashi)

² Which would still be an act of idolatry (Rashi)

³ Why is it called idolatry, if it doesn't prohibit the entity? (Tosafot)

⁴ Why is an אשירה prohibited? (Avodah Zarah 45a)

⁵ Why did Rav Huna stress it is 'sprawled' already? (Tosafot)

⁶ Why did Rav Huna specify that it is in front of the idol? (Tosafot)

⁷ Is this a challenge to the braisa, or to Rav Huna? (Two views in Rashi)