

Chullin 39

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

39a

Gemara: Continuing in the discussion of intent for avodah zarah during shechitah

| מחשבה מעבודה לעבודה (Thought about one avodah during a different avodah) | | | | |
|--|-------------|----------------------------|---------------|--|
| | R' Yochanan | Reish Lakish | R' Yosi | R' Yosi as explained by R' Yochanan |
| Kodashim, for pigul | Effective | Effective | Effective | Effective |
| Kodashim, shelo lishmah | Effective | Not effective | Effective | Effective ¹ |
| Chullin, for avodah zarah | Effective | Not effective ² | Not effective | Effective for זריקה ³ and שחיטה |

39b

Gemara: Braisa supports R' Yochanan

- זריקה-הקטרה שחיטה, disqualifying based on thought during מחשבין מעבודה לעבודה
- Braisa also says that if the thought was expressed after שחיטה, we don't permit or prohibit
 - #1 - Rav Chisda – It's the debate from 38b about reading minds
 - #2 – Rav Shizbi – They didn't permit because we can extrapolate from his final intent
 - Might we see this in reading the mind of a man who ordered a גט written and then jumped off a roof?
 - We see this in reading the mind of someone who received a gift, then protested

Gemara: Returning to our mishnah's debate about the owner's/שוהט's intent

- Shemuel – We follow R' Yosi from 39a - The שוהט's thought is what counts
- Story of travelling Arab merchants⁴ who wanted animal נשהט and intended meat for avodah zarah – it's fine
- Within R' Eliezer: What if the non-Jew buys meat from you?⁵
 - It depends on whether you may refuse⁶

Mishnah: More regarding shechitah for avodah zarah

- Shechitah for avodah zarah is disqualified
- Shechitah by two people, with one intending avodah zarah, is disqualified

¹ To understand the gemara's explanation of Reish Lakish, see Rashi, Tosafot and Maharsha (Mahadura Kama and Mahadura Basra)

² He is still liable for idolatry (Tosafot), but his shechitah is kosher and he is not a מין (R' Shlomo Eiger from Tosafot Avodah Zarah 26b)

³ But a thought for זריקה will only render the blood off-limits, not the meat (Tosafot, and see Maharsha)

⁴ Is Rashi anachronistically retro-fitting Muslim zabiha practices to explain why they asked a Jew? And is it true?

⁵ We assume your refusal could trump מעות קיונות (Tosafot)

⁶ Rashash – See Mishneh Torah, Hilchot Chametz uMatzah 4:4